

TODD KIM, Assistant Attorney General  
S. JAY GOVINDAN, Acting Section Chief  
MEREDITH L. FLAX, Assistant Section Chief  
CHRISTIAN H. CARRARA, Trial Attorney  
(NJ Bar No. 317732020)  
United States Department of Justice  
Environment & Natural Resources Division  
Wildlife & Marine Resources Section  
Ben Franklin Station  
P.O. Box 7611  
Washington, DC 20044-7611  
Tel: (202) 598-9736  
Fax: (202) 305-0275  
Email: christian.carrara@usdoj.gov

*Attorneys for Federal Defendants*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW MEXICO**

**CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL  
DIVERSITY,**

Plaintiff,

v.

**DEBRA HAALAND**, in her official capacity  
as Secretary of the U.S. Department of the  
Interior, **MARTHA WILLIAMS**, in her  
official capacity as Director of the U.S. Fish  
and Wildlife Service, and **U.S. FISH AND  
WILDLIFE SERVICE.**

Defendants.

No. 1:22-cv-00387-SMV-LF

**STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT**

This Stipulated Settlement Agreement (“Agreement”) is entered into by and between Plaintiff Center for Biological Diversity (“Center”) and Defendants Debra Haaland, in her official capacity as Secretary of the Interior (“Interior”), Martha Williams, in her official capacity as

Director of the United States Fish and Wildlife Service, and the United States Fish and Wildlife Service (“Service”) (collectively, “Defendants”), who, by and through their undersigned counsel, state as follows:

WHEREAS, on May 8, 2018, the Center submitted a petition requesting that the Service list the dunes sagebrush lizard (*Sceloporus arenicolus*) as threatened or endangered under the Endangered Species Act (“ESA”), 16 U.S.C. § 1531 *et seq.*;

WHEREAS, in accordance with 16 U.S.C. § 1533(b)(3)(A), the Service issued a “90-day finding” in response to the petition to list the dunes sagebrush lizard, in which the Service concluded that the petition presented substantial information indicating that the listing of the species under the ESA “may be warranted,” *see* 85 Fed. Reg. 43,203-43,204 (July 16, 2020);

WHEREAS, on November 17, 2021, Plaintiff notified Defendants by letter of its intent to file suit to compel the Service to complete a 12-month finding on the dunes sagebrush lizard petition, pursuant to 16 U.S.C. § 1533(b)(3)(B);

WHEREAS, on January 13, 2022, the Service responded to Plaintiff’s November 17, 2021, letter, and provided an update regarding the agency’s expected timeline for the completion of the 12-month finding concerning the dunes sagebrush lizard;

WHEREAS, on May 19, 2022, Plaintiff filed a complaint in the above-captioned action to compel the Service to complete the 12-month finding identified above by a date certain, *see* Docket (“Dkt.”) 1 (“Complaint”);

WHEREAS, the parties, by and through their authorized representatives, and without any admission or final adjudication of the issues of fact or law with respect to Plaintiff’s claims, have reached a settlement that they consider to be a just, fair, adequate, and equitable resolution of the disputes set forth in Plaintiff’s complaint;

WHEREAS, the parties agree that settlement of this action in this manner is in the public interest and is an appropriate way to resolve the dispute between them;

NOW, THEREFORE, the parties hereby stipulate and agree as follows:

1. On or before June 29, 2023, the Service shall review the status of the dunes sagebrush lizard and submit to the Federal Register a 12-month finding as to whether the listing

of the species as threatened or endangered is (a) not warranted; (b) warranted; or (c) warranted but precluded by other pending proposals, pursuant to 16 U.S.C. § 1533(b)(3)(B);

2. The order entering this Agreement may be modified by the Court upon good cause shown, consistent with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, by written stipulation between the parties filed with and approved by the Court, or upon written motion filed by one of the parties and granted by the Court. In the event that either party seeks to modify the terms of this Agreement, including the deadline specified in Paragraph 1, or in the event of a dispute arising out of or relating to this Agreement, or in the event that either party believes that the other party has failed to comply with any term or condition of this Agreement, the party seeking the modification, raising the dispute, or seeking enforcement shall provide the other party with notice of the claim. The parties agree that they will meet and confer (either telephonically or in person) at the earliest possible time in a good-faith effort to resolve the claim before seeking relief from the Court. If the parties are unable to resolve the claim themselves, either party may seek relief from the Court.

3. In the event that Defendants fail to meet the deadline specified in Paragraph 1 and have not sought to modify it, Plaintiff's first remedy shall be a motion to enforce the terms of this Agreement, after following the dispute resolution procedures described above. This Agreement shall not, in the first instance, be enforceable through a proceeding for contempt of court.

4. This Agreement requires only that the Service take the actions specified in Paragraph 1. No provision of this Agreement shall be interpreted as, or constitute, a commitment or requirement that Defendants take action in contravention of the ESA, the Administrative Procedure Act ("APA"), or any other law or regulation, either substantive or procedural. Nothing in this Agreement shall be construed to limit or modify the discretion accorded to the Service by the ESA, the APA, or general principles of administrative law with respect to the procedures to be followed in making any determination required herein, or as to the substance of any determination required herein. To challenge any final determination issued in accordance with this Agreement, Plaintiff will be required to file a separate action, and Defendants reserve the

right to raise any applicable claims or defenses in response thereto.

5. Without waiving any defenses or making any admissions, Defendants agree to pay Plaintiff \$3,167.00 in attorneys' fees and costs. Plaintiff agrees to accept the \$3,167.00 from Defendants in full satisfaction of any and all claims, demands, rights, and causes of action for any and all attorneys' fees and costs Plaintiff reasonably incurred in connection with the above captioned litigation through the signing of this Agreement.

6. Plaintiff agrees to furnish Defendants with the information necessary to effectuate the \$3,167.00 payment set forth by Paragraph 5. Payment will be made to the Center for Biological Diversity by electronic funds transfer. Defendants agree to submit all necessary paperwork for the processing of the attorneys' fees award to the Department of Treasury's Judgment Fund Office within fifteen (15) days of receipt of the necessary information from Plaintiff or from approval of this Agreement by the Court, whichever is later. Defendants do not waive any right to contest fees and costs claimed by Plaintiff or Plaintiff's counsel in any future litigation or continuation of the present action.

7. No part of this Agreement shall have precedential value in any litigation or in representations before any court or forum or in any public setting. No party shall use this Agreement or the terms herein as evidence of what does or does not constitute a reasonable timeline for making determinations regarding the listing of or designation of critical habitat for any species.

8. Nothing in this Agreement shall be construed or offered as evidence in any proceeding as an admission or concession of any wrongdoing, liability, or any issue of fact or law concerning the claims settled under this Agreement or any similar claims brought in the future by any other party. Except as expressly provided in this Agreement, the parties do not waive or relinquish any legal rights, claims, or defenses they may have. This Agreement is executed for the purpose of settling Plaintiff's Complaint, and nothing herein shall be construed as precedent having preclusive effect in any other context.

9. Nothing in this Agreement shall be interpreted as, or shall constitute, a requirement that Defendants are obligated to pay any funds exceeding those available, or take

any action in contravention of the Anti-Deficiency Act, 31 U.S.C. § 1341, or any other applicable appropriations law.

10. The parties agree that this Agreement was negotiated in good faith and it constitutes a settlement of claims disputed by the parties. By entering into this Agreement, the parties do not waive any legal rights, claims, or defenses, except as expressly stated herein. This Agreement contains all of the terms of agreement between the parties concerning Plaintiff's Complaint, and is intended to be the final and sole agreement between the parties with respect thereto. The parties agree that any prior or contemporaneous representations or understanding not explicitly contained in this written Agreement, whether written or oral, are of no further legal or equitable force or effect.

11. The undersigned representatives of each party certify that they are fully authorized by the party or parties they represent to agree to the terms and conditions of this Agreement and do hereby agree to the terms herein. Further, each party, by and through its undersigned representative, represents and warrants that it has the legal power and authority to enter into this Agreement and bind itself to the terms and conditions contained in this Agreement.

12. The terms of this Agreement shall become effective upon entry of an order by the Court approving the Agreement.

13. Upon approval of this Agreement by the Court, all counts of Plaintiff's Complaint shall be dismissed with prejudice. Notwithstanding the dismissal of this action, however, the parties hereby stipulate and respectfully request that the Court retain jurisdiction to oversee compliance with the terms of this Agreement and to resolve any motions to modify such terms. *See Kokkonen v. Guardian Life Ins. Co. of Am.*, 511 U.S. 375 (1994).

Electronically approved on: August 25, 2022 Respectfully submitted by,

/s/ Douglas Wolf

DOUGLAS W. WOLF (NM Bar # 7473)  
3191 La Avenida de New Mexico  
Santa Fe, NM 87507  
703-994-1309  
Email: [dwwolf@aol.com](mailto:dwwolf@aol.com)

/s/ Camila Cossio

CAMILA COSSIO (OR Bar # 191504)  
Center for Biological Diversity  
P.O. Box 11374  
Portland, OR 97211-0374  
Tel: (917) 717-6727  
Email: [ccossio@biologicaldiversity.org](mailto:ccossio@biologicaldiversity.org)

/s/ Brian Segee

BRIAN SEGEE (Ca. Bar # 200795)  
Center for Biological Diversity  
660 S. Figueroa Street, Suite 1000  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Tel: (805) 750-8852  
Email: [bsegee@biologicaldiversity.org](mailto:bsegee@biologicaldiversity.org)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff*

TODD KIM, Assistant Attorney General  
S. JAY GOVINDAN, Acting Section Chief  
MEREDITH L. FLAX, Assistant Section Chief

/s/ Chris Carrara

CHRISTIAN H. CARRARA  
Trial Attorney (NJ Bar # 317732020)

United States Department of Justice  
Environment & Natural Resources Division  
Wildlife & Marine Resources Section  
P.O. Box 7611  
Washington, DC 20044-7611  
Tel: (202) 598-9736  
Fax: (202) 305-0275  
Email: [Christian.carrara@usdoj.gov](mailto:Christian.carrara@usdoj.gov)

*Of Counsel:*

FRANK LUPO, Southwest Regional Solicitor  
United States Department of the Interior  
Office of the Solicitor  
Southwest Regional Office

*Attorneys for Defendants*